Curricular Tensions
Traditionalists vs. Progressives

Read: From Reader, 

Articles, 
Abrahams, "The Application of Critical Pedagogy to Music Teaching and Learning: A Literature Review"
Schmidt, "Music Education as Transformative Practice: Creating New Frameworks for Learning Music through a Freirian Perspective"
1. According to Patrick Schmidt, music teachers today are only aesthetic teachers, meaning they:
A: teach beauty for beauty's sake
B: teach only correct technique
C: disconnect students from the power of music to unite the world
D: all of the above

2. Abraham breaks down lesson planning into four steps. Which of these steps is NOT one that he uses?
a. codification
b. exposition
c. improvisation
d. development
e. recapitulation

3. With which of the following populations did Freire work as part of his literacy initiative?
A.) Early childhood
B.) Elementary students
C.) Secondary students
D.) Adult learners
Historical Foundations of Curriculum, Pt. 2

**Tyler** (1949)—*Basic Principles of Curriculum and Instruction*, proposed a scientific footing for curriculum

**Pinar** (1995)—*Understanding Curriculum*, in this reconceptualization of curriculum, understanding and meaning making replace improvement (improvement as a means of preserving practice by incremental changes to teaching/learning practices)
Traditionalists vs. Progressives: a good example is the polarity of positions held by Bobbitt and Dewey on the direction that curriculum planning should take. According to Bobbitt, children should enter the world of adults, and learn the skills and valuations adults need to become productive members of the workforce and society. Dewey believed that for education to be meaningful, teachers should enter the world of the child.

Product vs. Process: content (what to teach—E.D. Hirsch's *Cultural Literacy: What Every American Needs to Know*) vs. pedagogy (how to teach—Howard Gardner, *The Disciplined Mind*). Hirsch provides a 63 pp. list of facts, names, and dates that he believes all persons need to know in order to be “culturally literate.” Gardner proposes a curriculum based on understanding and problem solving that revolves around the search for the true, the good and the beautiful.

“In deciding what and how to teach our children, we are expressing and thus exposing our identity—personal, social and cultural. In expressing what we think is true and important, we run the risk that others who disagree may oppose us or that we may come to question our own beliefs.” (Gardner)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Traditionalists</strong></th>
<th><strong>Progressives</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Suspicious of change—our knowledge has been created by struggles over many years and is too precious to tinker with; it’s important to leave our legacy for our children—better future can only be built on solid base of past achievement</td>
<td>Favor change—prevailing ideas are aligned with the past, and tend to be conservative if not regressive; present is imperfect and we must work to improve it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treats past with reverence and respect, as a valuable inheritance to pass on to our young.</td>
<td>See history as dynamic—no need to worry about preserving what is valuable from the past—tremendous inertia built into human affairs will protect our inheritance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditionalists</td>
<td>Progressives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Align themselves with the mature adult, who is the wise judge of what the young need to know; discipline is required to curb impetuous nature of the young</td>
<td>Align themselves with the young, who are untainted by past prejudices—against entrenched power base—youth is innocent and good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Where is music education today?</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study of discrete academic disciplines provides training for the mind; both rationality and mastery of knowledge are essential—traditions and institutions bring order to life</td>
<td>Freedom more important than discrete disciplines—only original exploration can discover directions toward a better future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditionalists believe that individuals must conform to the prevailing views, which are usually the views of those in power, supported by traditional ideas</td>
<td>Individuals must think for themselves, to combat the tendency toward authoritarian control</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“We asked one of these "sowers of words," finishing the first level of literacy classes, why he hadn't learned to read and write before the agrarian reform. "Before the agrarian reform, my friend," he said, "I didn't even think. Neither did my friends." "Why?" we asked. "Because it wasn't possible. We lived under orders. We only had to carry out orders. We had nothing to say," he replied emphatically. The simple answer of this peasant is a very clear analysis of "the culture of silence." In the culture of silence, to exist is only to live. The body carries out orders from above. Thinking is difficult, speaking the word, forbidden.”

Can you think of an analogy to our current educational system today? Are any voices being “silenced”? By whom? And why?
Critical Pedagogy: Education...

- is a conversation where students and their teachers pose problems and solve problems together
- broadens the student’s view of reality
- is empowering, leads students to point where they “know that they know” = “conscientization”...conscientization implies knowing that includes understanding and the ability to act on the learning in such a way as to affect a change—“and to take action against the oppressive elements of reality”
- is transformative
- is political, acknowledging issues of power and control

4 Questions: Who am I? Who are my students? What might they become? What might we become together?
Questions:
What role does music education play in the larger educational picture and what role could it play?
Who is allowed to participate in the dialogue, at both the macro and micro levels?
How can music education develop research that is focused on social-cultural-philosophical aspects, and that leads the profession to search for educational and social equality?
If oppression is the inability to ask questions, how can music as a subject which is based upon creation and transformation, and consequently on inquiry, be an engine for consciousness and development of meaning?
What is the role of music in our students’ and their teachers’ intertwined lives?
Informal Learning

Break into pairs, and think of a way to bring elements of informal music learning into a formal music teaching/learning setting in your situation.

How could your students benefit from the advantages of informal learning?

How can you structure the activity or lesson so as to minimize the disadvantages of informal learning?
Read for July 12

Read: From Aims, Ch. 6
From Reader,
Elliot Eisner, “What Does it Mean to Say a School is Doing Well?”, Ch. 24, pp. 313-322

Articles,
Dunbar-Hall, “Colliding Perspectives? Music Curriculum as Cultural Studies”
Eisner, "Who Decides What Schools Teach?"

Treasure Hunt #2 presented in class